

**Sharing European Educational Experience in Public Health for Israel
(SEEEPHI):
harmonization, employability, leadership and outreach**

Kick-Off Meeting Minutes

13:00-16:00 CET Monday 8 February and 09:00-12:00 Friday 12 February

Venue: Zoom

Participants:

Orna Baron-Epel, UH
Osnat Bashkin, AAC
Tsipi Burac, IAPHP
Jenny Cadstedt, SRCUC
Kasia Czabanowska, UM
Nadav Davidovitch, BGU
Keren Dopelt, BGU/AAC
Mariusz Duplaga, JU
Elie Friedman, AAC
Manfred Green, UH
Dana Ivancovsk, UH
Lore Leighton, ASPHER
Hagai Levine, IAPHP
Fiona MacLeod, UCC

Maureen Malowany, HUJI
Ilona Metcalf, JU
John Middleton, ASPHER
Zohar Mor, AAC
Yehuda Neumark, HIJU
Jascha Nooijer, UM
Robert Otok, ASPHER
Stéphanie Paillard-Borg, SRCUC
Ivan Perry, UCC
Luigi Saia, EACEA,
Ted Tulchinsky, AAC
Tali Vaknin, BGU
Dana Wajcman, UH
Shira Zelber, UH

Day 1: 13:00-16:00 CET Monday 8 February

All partner institutions were counted present

1. Opening of the Meeting

- 1.1. Welcome from ASPHER President John Middleton
- 1.2. ASPHER Introduction: Robert Otok introduced ASPHER and the ASPHER team
- 1.3. Agenda Outline: Lore Leighton presented the Kick-off meeting agenda outline. (see <https://www.aspher.org/seeephi-kickoff-agenda.html>)
- 1.4. Partner Teams Round of Introductions: Each partner Institution introduced their team:
 - P2: Ashkelon Academic College (AAC)
 - P3: Hebrew University of Jerusalem – Braun School of Public Health (HUJI)
 - P4: University College Cork (UCC)
 - P5: University of Haifa (UH)

- P6: Jagiellonian University (JU)
- P7: Israeli Association of Public Health Physicians (IAPHP)
- P8: The Swedish Red Cross University College (SRCUC)
- P9: Ben-Gurion University of the Negev (BGU)
- P10: Maastricht University (UM)

2. General update on technical items

- 2.1. Grant Agreement – Robert Otok explained some of the administrative delays with signing of the Grant Agreement. Original Project start date was expected in mid-November. Grant Agreement has now been signed between ASPHER (on behalf of beneficiaries) and EACEA. See: <https://www.aspher.org/download/637/contract-66-convbg-618578-signed-aspher-1.pdf>
- 2.2. Pre-financing of project still awaiting final approval of 3rd party financial guarantee provided by BGU. Breakdown of payments:
 - 50% at start of project
 - 40% at end of year 2
 - 10% upon completion of project
- 2.3. Project Officer is Luigi Saia, who will join the second part of the Kick-off meeting on Friday 12 February
- 2.4. EACEA Conference for Capacity Building in Higher Education new grantees (attended by Lore Leighton and Nadav Davidovitch) – Lore Leighton presented takeaways from the Conference. See slides: https://www.aspher.org/download/668/seeephi_kickoff_slides_ll.pdf
Including information on Covid adjustment suggestions:
 - Plan adjustments for only the first 6 months – wait to see what is feasible later
 - Try to work within 10% budget flexibility that does not require EACEA approval when making adjustments
- 2.5. Partnership Agreement – Robert Otok presented the Partnership Agreement and key points (see 1st draft: <https://www.aspher.org/repository,10,67,644.html>)
 - Standard language based on EACEA template agreement
 - ASPHER is contact point for communication with EACEA
 - Budget and schedule of payments will be discussed in more detail Friday – all partners will receive a percentage up front, remainder will be distributed as justified by the work with priority to partners working on earlier WPs
 - Appointment of two Focal Points for Communication purposes – direct communication with ASPHER always available (approval to be deferred until Friday): Nadav Davidovitch for Israel and Kasia Czabanowska for EU
 - Target to have version ready for signing by partners at end of Kick-off meeting.

- Zohar Mor asked to add specific language to agreement about co-financing from beneficiaries
- See second draft of Partnership Agreement available here: <https://www.aspher.org/repository,10,67,644.html>

3. Project Outline, part 1

- 3.1. Overview of Aims and Objectives of the proposal were presented by Lore Leighton. See slides: https://www.aspher.org/download/668/seeephi_kickoff_slides_ll.pdf
- 3.1.1. AIM: Enhancement of the public health workforce (PHW) in Israel through sharing European educational experience, including:
- HARMONIZATION
 - EMPLOYABILITY
 - LEADERSHIP
 - OUTREACH
- 3.1.2. OBJECTIVES (Corresponding to WPs 2-6):
1. Detailed analysis of field qualifications content to understand different professional roles in the Israeli public health system.
 2. Mapping of the competency profiles of the Israeli schools and programmes of public health to guide HARMONIZATION between public health education and practice.
 3. Introduction of a dynamic online interface to enable public health education/training – practice/workforce collaboration, supporting EMPLOYABILITY and continuing professional development.
 4. Building LEADERSHIP capacity via cutting edge training in the Israeli public health schools and programmes.
 5. Stakeholder engagement to secure key OUTREACH (community, inter-professional, cross-sectoral).
- 3.2. Timeline – Overview of Project Timeline for all WPs was presented by Robert Otok. See slides: https://www.aspher.org/download/669/seeephi-monday-timeline-admin-wps-ro_slides.pdf
- 3.3. Administrative WPs were presented by Robert Otok. All administrative WPs run for the duration of the project. See slides: https://www.aspher.org/download/669/seeephi-monday-timeline-admin-wps-ro_slides.pdf
- 3.3.1. WP1 Management (Project Coordination)
- Lead partner: ASPHER
 - Timelines & Activities
 - Y1 M2 – face-to-face meeting (BE/WP8)
 - Y1 M11 – face-to-face meeting (IE)
 - Y2 M8 – face-to-face meeting (PL/WP8)
 - Y3 M2 – face-to-face meeting (SE)
 - Y3 M10 – face-to-face meeting (NL/WP8)

- Deliverables
(partnership agreement, intranet, mtg summaries & reports)
- 3.3.2. WP7 Dissemination & Exploitation
 - Lead partner: IAPHP & ASPHER
 - Timelines & Activities
 - Y1 M2+ – website, newsletter, social media...
 - Y1 M5 – ASPHER DD Retreat 2021 (presentation)
 - Y2 M5 – ASPHER DD Retreat 2022 (presentation)
 - Y2 M6 – IAPHP conference 2022 (workshop)
 - Y3 M5 – ASPHER DD Retreat 2023 (presentation)
 - Y3 M6 – IAPHP conference 2023 (workshop)
 - Y3 M11 – EPH conference 2023 (project final conference)
 - Y3 M12 – Public Health Reviews (project supplement)
 - Deliverables
(website, newsletter, social media, presentations, dissemination workshops, final conference, PHRS journal supplement)
 - **Action point: Logo needed for the project**
 - Should be something meaningful to Israel
 - Opportunity to engage all partners in activity
 - Send ideas toward end of February
- 3.3.3. WP8 Quality Plan
 - Lead partner: BGU (transferred from AAC)
 - Timelines & Activities
 - Y1 M2 – evaluation committee (BE/WP1)
 - Y1 M5 & M10 – teleconference calls
 - Y2 M2 – face-to-face meeting (IL)
 - Y2 M8 – face-to-face meeting (PL/WP1)
 - Y2 M5 & M10 – teleconference calls
 - Y3 M3 – face-to-face meeting (IL)
 - Y3 M10 – face-to-face meeting (NL/WP1)
 - Y3 M5 & M8 – teleconference calls
 - Deliverables (mtg summaries & reports)

4. Election of Evaluation Committee

- Proposed to have four Internal Evaluators (2 from EU, 2 from Israel) + 1 External Evaluator
- 4.1. Internal Evaluation Committee: Suggestions thus far for Internal EC:
 - Nadav Davidovitch, BGU (Israel focal point)
 - Kasia Czabanowska, UM (EU focal point) – KC preferred to give space to others as one FP was already included.
 - Keren Dopelt, as both AAC and BGU representative
 - Other EU representative, TBD
- 4.2. External Evaluator

- Paul Barach. See CV and Bio:
<https://www.aspher.org/download/652/paul-barach-cv-2020.pdf>; <https://www.aspher.org/download/653/barach-bio-2020.pdf>
- Ted Tulchinsky – TT declined, but suggested three external evaluators: 1 Israel, 1 EU, 1 other

Action: Discussion to be continued Friday

Action: Send names and suggestions to Lore Leighton for consideration before Friday

5. AOB

- Invitation to SEEPHI WhatsApp Group:
<https://chat.whatsapp.com/HliXiWELdk9EBo1Y5LVfAC>

6. Day 1 Meeting Adjourned

Day 2: 9:00-12:00 CET Friday 12 February

All partner institutions were counted present

1. Opening of the Meeting

- 1.1. Welcome from ASPHER President John Middleton
- 1.2. Review of Project Aims and Objectives and brief introduction to partners by Lore Leighton
- 1.3. Address from Ted Tulchinsky on history and direction of the project and the importance to have good quality control with emphasis to refer back to the evaluation reports of Schools of Public Health by the Israel Council on Higher Education.
- 1.4. Address from EACEA Project Officer, Luigi Saia
 - Luigi Saia thanked the consortium for the invitation to speak
 - He congratulated SEEPHI for being selected, noting that all partners can be proud to be amongst 10% selected
 - He has a sense of feeling of a solid partnership within the consortium with good atmosphere and relations – success will depend on everyone
 - His role will be to assist, not to control
 - He provided some tips for success:
 - Have good relations with good partnership agreement and transparency
 - Have good quality plan
 - With final report EACEA will look for results – make all efforts to achieve objectives
 - Have a dissemination plan from the beginning
 - Keep reports simple and clear

- Keep in mind that Israel is the beneficiary of the action – maintain aim and balance
- Be sure to have impact at instate
- Keep good relations and sharing with non-academic labour market
- The partners stressed the urgency to transfer the prefinancing budget in order to pay staff for preliminary work packages.
 - Luigi Saia assured that he was following up on the prefinancing situation every day
 - He suggested that the start date could be delayed with a request for extension of the project if needed.
 - He advised also to be in touch with Dina Gallera – ERASMUS contact point in Israel for dealing with any legal and tax issues.

2. Partnership Agreement - Discussion continued from Monday

- Lore Leighton outlined changes made to the Partnership Agreement
See slides: <https://www.aspher.org/download/671/seeephi-kickoff-pa-ec-friday-11-slides.pdf>
See new 2nd draft Partnership Agreement:
<https://www.aspher.org/repository,10,67,644.html>
 - Appointment of Nadav Davidovitch and Kasia Czabanowska as focal points for Israel and EU were confirmed (Article 3.2)
 - Explicit language on Partners contributing 10% additional resources was added (Article 4.3) – note: this can be in kind staff hour contributions
 - Payment arrangements (article 5): 25% of each partner’s share of the prefinancing will be made up front. Balances will be paid upon justification of the progression of the project work and subject to the availability of the funds in order to maintain liquidity and allow for smooth progression of work.

Action: Please take this back to your institutions for consultation and consideration – aim to sign toward end of February

3. Evaluation Committee - Discussion continued from Monday

- 3.1. Internal Evaluation Committee - There is a need to have the best quality evaluation possible with ethical and objective evaluation and different institutions represented
 - It was agreed that Nadav Davidovitch from BGU would act as an Internal Evaluator as a representative of the organisation putting forward the 3rd party guarantee for the project prefinancing
 - It was agreed that Keren Dopelt would act as an Internal Evaluator signing with her formal academic affiliation with AAC
 - It was agreed that UCC and JU would nominate candidates for Internal Evaluators from EU (**Update: Dr Janas Harrington proposed from UCC – see bio in project proposal**)

3.2. External Evaluators – It was agreed that there should be 3 external evaluators

- Orly Manor to serve from the Israel perspective /focus
- Paul Barach to serve from Israel with global picture perspective
- Walter Ricciardi – would be approached to serve from the EU perspective.

4. Project outline, part 2 (Content Work Packages) – Robert Otok presented the Content work packages and timeline with discussion of how they interact and Covid impacts. See slides:

<https://www.aspher.org/download/670/seeephi-kickoff-timeline-core-wps-friday-ro-slides.pdf>

4.1. Work package 2 – field qualifications

- Lead partners: AAC & ASPHER
- Timeline: Activities & Deliverables
 - *Field qualification analysis in the Israeli public health system*
 - Y1 M3 – Meeting (WP2-#1-AAC /WP3 link)
 - Y1 M4 – Survey instrument
 - Y1 M4-M9 – Online survey (complemented w/key prs interviews)
 - Y1 M10 – Meeting (WP2-#2-AAC /WP3 link)
 - Y1 M11 – Report from the survey (WP2 report)
 - *PHI Qualification Map (entry/competent/expert levels)*

4.2. Work package 3 – schools & programmes

- Lead partners: Braun SPH & UCC
- Timeline: : Activities & Deliverables
 - *Mapping of the competency profiles of the Israeli schools and programmes of public health*
 - Y1 M3 – Meeting (WP3-#1-BSPH /WP2 link)
 - Y1 M4 – Survey instrument
 - Y1 M4-M9 – Online survey
 - Y1 M10 – Meeting (WP3-#2-BSPH /WP2 link)
 - Y1 M12 – Report from the survey (WP3 report)
 - *PHI SPHs Competency Map*

4.3. Work package 4 – workforce adaptation

- Lead partners: Haifa SPH & JU-KR + UCC
- Timeline: Activities & Deliverables
 - *Workforce adaptation and employability in the Israeli public health system*
 - Y2 M2 – Meeting (WP4-#1-HSPH)
 - Y2 M6 – Online tool
 - Y2 M10 – Practical placement scheme
 - Y3 M3 – Meeting (WP4-#2-HSPH)
 - Y3 M3 – Practical placement scheme
 - Y3 M6 – Career fair

- *PHI Reference Framework, PHI Practical Placement Scheme, PHI Career Fair*
- 4.4. Work package 5 – leadership capacity building
- Lead partners: BGU-SPH & UM
 - Timeline: Activities & Deliverables
 - *Building leadership capacity in the Israeli public health system*
 - Y2 M7 – Meeting (WP5-#1-BGUSPH)
 - Y2 M12 – Leadership Academy train the trainer manual
 - Y3 M7 – Meeting (WP5-#2-BGUSPH)
 - Y3 M3-7+11 – peer train the trainer sessions (5+1)
 - Y3 M9+12 – Reports from the Leadership Academy pilot (PEER 5+1)
 - *PHI Leadership Academy*
- 4.5. Work package 6 – stakeholder engagement
- Lead partners: IAPHP & SRCUC + B-SPH
 - Timeline: Activities & Deliverables
 - *Stakeholder engagement*
 - Y2 M4 – IAMPH campaign plan
 - Y2 M5 – Meeting (WP6-#2-IAPHP)
 - Y2 M6+10+12 – IAMPH stories
 - Y2 M6 – IAMPH at IAPHP 2022
 - Y2 M7 – PHW register
 - Y3 M5 – Meeting (WP6-#2-IAPHP)
 - Y3 M2+4+5+9+11 – IAMPH stories
 - Y3 M6 – IAMPH at IAPHP 2023
 - Y3 M7 – Report from the IAMPH campaign pilot
 - *I am public health campaign, PHW register*
5. **Budget** – Robert Otok presented the Budget payment schedule and the adjustments represented by the portion of the equipment budget deemed ineligible, transfer of WP8 from AAC to BGU, and Covid meeting savings. See slides: <https://www.aspher.org/download/670/seeephi-kickoff-timeline-core-wps-friday-ro-slides.pdf>
6. **Next Management Meeting is scheduled to be held at University College Cork (COVID conditions permitting) in M11 (November 2021)**
7. **Meeting Closed**